HLC Agenda: 4-03-02 Item No.: 2.b. and 5.a.



# Memorandum

**TO:** Historic Landmarks Commission **FROM:** Courtney Damkroger

**SUBJECT: HP02-002/H02-009 DATE:** March 20, 2002

EXTERIOR ALTERATIONS TO A HISTORIC HOUSE IN THE HENSLEY HISTORIC DISTRICT

APPROVED: DATE:

# **BACKGROUND**

The applicant, the Redevelopment Agency, is requesting a Historic Preservation permit to allow the exterior changes to a relocated two-family dwelling displaced by the Civic Center project. The site is an approximately 0.22 gross acre site at 457 N. Fourth Street. The property is zoned R-M Multi Family Residential and is located within the Hensley Historic District. A Site Development permit (H02-009) is required for the conversion of the duplex to a single-family residence. The Historic Preservation permit (HP02-002) allows for the appropriate exterior changes to this structure within the Hensley Historic District.

The Historic Landmarks Commission's comments will be forwarded to the Director of Planning and both of these permits will be considered by the Director of Planning at a public hearing on Wednesday, April 10, 2002.

# HISTORIC RESOURCE DESCRIPTION

The structure for which exterior changes are proposed was evaluated as part of the Environmental Impact Report prepared for the Civic Plaza Redevelopment Area. A brief description of the structure and its historic significance as described in the Civic Plaza EIR follows:

**12-16 S. 5<sup>th</sup> Street:** This 1888, Stick Style, two story, rectangular plan, wood frame, hipped roof house has rustic siding on the exterior walls. The projecting front roof eaves have decorative modillion blocks and dentils. The two-square bay window has one over one, wood-sash, double hung windows above inset panels. The house has an angled bay window on the south façade. The projecting hipped roof front entrance porch has two rounded columns (the center column is missing). The original columns have been removed. The metal porch/stair balustrade and basement-level gate are modern alterations. The corner pilasters on the front façade appear to be an early alteration.

This building is listed as an Identified Structure in the San Jose Historic Resources Inventory and is eligible as a Structure of Merit based on the evaluations done for the Civic Plaza



Historic Landmarks Commission April 3, 2002 Page 2

Environmental Impact report. This house has received a number of insensitive later alterations that have diminished its historic integrity. The house is not a distinguished example of Stick Style architecture in San Jose, and it is not associated with persons significant in local history and therefore does not appear to be eligible for the California Register of Historic Places.

# **ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**

The project is covered by a Final EIR entitled, "Civic Plaza Redevelopment Plan," and adopted by City Council Resolution No. 68905 on June 8, 1999.

#### **ANALYSIS**

The Redevelopment Agency provided historic homes relocated through this process with basic rehabilitation plans in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The Landmarks Commission reviewed the plans for the various homes over the course of 2001. The plans were developed by Craig Mineweaser and Architectural Resources Group. The current proposal was further refined by Craig Mineweaser to assist the new owners with conversion to a single family home. The home relocated to 457 N Fourth Street was originally located on an interior lot and has been relocated to a corner lot in the Hensley district.

The Historic Preservation permit allows for the rehabilitation of a single-family house following many of the recommendations of the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings. The exterior of the building will be preserved by patching, piecing-in, consolidating, or reinforcing the wood siding using recognized preservation methods. The existing wood windows will be protected and maintained through appropriate surface treatments such as cleaning, rust removal, limited paint removal, and re-application of protective coating systems. The paints colors shall be identified and compatible historic colors shall be called out on the plan set. A brief discussion of the proposed alterations and how they meet the Secretary of the Interior Standards follows:

#### Rear Elevation

The removal of a second story shed addition, construction of a new second story addition, new bay window and deck

#### Standards

The second story shed proposed for demolition was an alteration that diminished the historic integrity of the structure. The room addition that is proposed in its place will be placed on a non-character-defining elevation and the size and scale will be limited in relationship to the historic building. The addition shall not obscure, damage or destroy character-defining features.

### Street Side Elevation

The extension of the front porch, installation of five new windows and construction of a side vard fence.

#### Standards

The proposed additions shall be designed to be compatible with the size, scale, material, and the color of the historic building. The fence design shall be compatible with the Hensley Historic District and shall comply with the five-foot setback for corner lots as required by the Fence Regulations of the Zoning Ordinance.

Historic Landmarks Commission April 3, 2002 Page 3

#### Front Elevation

The extension of the porch and replication of balusters and front stairs.

#### Standards

The replacement of the missing front stairs and balusters will be an accurate restoration using historical, pictorial and physical documentation.

Planning staff believes that the proposal meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, in particular, Standards 1, 2, 6 and 9. A copy of the Standards is attached.

# **RECOMMENDATION**

Planning staff recommends the Historic Landmarks Commission support the project with the inclusion of the conditions noted above and forward comments to the Director of Planning regarding the proposed alterations to 457 North 4<sup>th</sup> Street.

Courtney Damkroger Historic Preservation Officer

Attachments

CC: Peter Larko, Redevelopment Agency